



Hybrid learning of ESP in Agriculture Field: Students' perceptions and learning experiences

Sugeng Susilo Adi*

Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia

This research has the objective of describing the learning perceptions and experiences of students of the Agro Eco Technology Study Program while attending the English for Specific Purposes (ESP) course that is organized with the mode of hybrid learning. The students who became the subject of this research were those who study at the Kediri campus of Universitas Brawijaya. They are 101 freshmen who had previously for two years experienced full online learning while studying in senior high school. This research used a mixed method, meaning applying both quantitative and qualitative approaches. Data are in the form of survey results and of interview results with several related parties, observations, and other relevant documents. Research results indicated that student perceptions regarding ESP learning were that it is able to improve the English language competence of students. Students found that the learning environment of ESP with hybrid learning was interesting, encouraging, enjoyable, accommodating of active participation, and not at all awkward. In addition, the opportunity given by the lecturer to students to show their work orally by uploading videos to a YouTube channel with the 'everybody is a YouTuber' program became a point that is perceived as able to encourage the students. They have positive responses about statements on the issues of attitude, of ease, of aspects of benefits, and of English language skills. The Internet connection that is sometimes unstable only became a minor hindrance.

Keywords: hybrid learning, perception, agriculture, ESP, experience, post pandemic

OPEN ACCESS

ISSN 2503 3492 (online)

*Correspondence: Sugeng Susilo Adi sugengadi@ub.ac.id

Received: 19th November 2022 Accepted: 26th March 2023 Published: 6th April 2023

Citation:

Adi, S.S. (2023). Hybrid learning of ESP in Agriculture Field: Students' perceptions and learning experiences. JEES (Journal of English Educators Society), 8(1).

INTRODUCTION

In several regions, during the COVID-19 pandemic, policymakers in the field of education possessed different considerations regarding whether to continue to hold classes with face-to-face meetings or to switch to online learning. There are certain reasons for different cases for these policymakers, including different risks that are related to the local demography or population density, and the uncertainty on health consequences for the public by the face-to-face learning model. The transfer period from direct learning to online learning and hybrid learning from 2020-21 has major consequences for the learning outcomes of students. In remote regencies, learning achievements are lower for all subjects, particularly for students that attend schools with high levels of poverty (Goldhaber, at al, 2022). Furthermore, it has been identified that access and connectivity to online classes in several regions are harder to come by than in other regions due to non-academic factors.

In several cases, the quality of Internet connectivity in one area is lacking or even insufficient, while other areas appear not to possess resources or equipment at all that are sufficient to support teleworking or tele-study at simultaneous times. University of Cádiz, for example, realized this fact and spent an incredible amount of funds to help its students, particularly in providing the availability of dependable Internet access (López-Zurita, 2022).

The coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic has become a period full of challenges for everyone. Education systems throughout the world were transitioned to the system of hybrid learning as the sole best choice in executing the learning process. Some of the literature indicates that learning in the classroom is not only a source of obtaining an education but also for acquiring social interactions. After two academic years of online or blended learning, the pandemic has driven not only lecturers but also students to improve their digital competence. At present, everyone has been able to develop their digital skills, and various online platforms are being utilized. In the beginning, lecturers still had not become familiar with online platforms such as Google Meet, Teams, Zoom, Webex, and so on. All of these represent new terms that initially had not yet been commonly used in everyday life and became a matter that was hard to believe two years ago (Sahar, 2020; López-Zurita, 2022).

During the pandemic there was a change in student behavior due to school closures. These changes can affect students' emotional well-being and student performance (Qanash, Mufthi, Algublan, et al, 2020). In addition, learning productivity and student character building at the level can be through literacy skills that shape character content (Rochman, et.al, 2020). Research conducted during 2020 showed that the lockdown due to covid-19 had an impact on students' anxiety and academic achievement. Variables like stress, anxiety, laziness were measured to be at high levels among students during 2020. Academic performance was affected due to changes in lifestyle of most students worldwide. During online learning, even though there is plenty of time to study, due to the lockdown, most students feel lazy, with a lack of desire to study and low levels of concentration (Bozdo & Banushi, 2022).

The model of hybrid learning, which in several cases is also known as blended learning, is a model where traditional learning is combined with an online approach based on the Internet. Various kinds of media are used in the environment of online learning, which are combined with a number of different approaches. Teaching and learning may be conducted synchronously or asynchronously through faceto-face or remote meetings. The hybrid model has been shown to be implemented in one of the largest federal higher education institutions in the UAE, but the findings of this research indicate that there are very many aspects in the model of hybrid learning. The hybrid academic model is a rather flexible system. Anyone can learn anytime, anywhere. However, many students lack the intrinsic motivation to succeed in the model of hybrid learning. Even so, many more students will still obtain greater benefits compared to

face-to-face classes (Beer, 2021).

Meanwhile, higher education institutions use different learning formats in the form of online lectures and seminars in supporting the learning of their students. In the past decade, higher education institutions have actively supported the increased usage of online learning to encourage flexibility and freedom. Because of the COVID-19 pandemic, the learning situation in higher education dramatically changed, and as such, many Higher Education Institutions were forced to transition all of their programs to the online learning format. Several institutions applied synchronous hybrid learning (SHL) as an extreme solution that balances different needs while maintaining social distancing (Priess-Buchheit, 2020). Higher learning institutions (HEIs) are using different learning modalities to encourage performance from better students accomplishing course requirements. A hybrid learning environment introduces opportunities for educational leaders, teachers and learners in finding alternative approaches to enhance traditional brick and mortar settings (Eliveria, 2019).

During the pandemic there was a change in student behavior due to school closures. These changes can affect students' emotional well-being and student performance (Qanash, Mufthi, Algublan, et al, 2020). In addition, learning productivity and student character building at the level can be through literacy skills that shape character content (Rochman, et.al, 2020). Research conducted during 2020 showed that the lockdown due to covid-19 had an impact on students' anxiety and academic achievement. Variables like stress, anxiety, laziness were measured to be at high levels among students during 2020. Academic performance was affected due to changes in lifestyle of most students worldwide. During online learning, even though there is plenty of time to study, due to the lockdown, most students feel lazy, with a lack of desire to study and low levels of concentration (Bozdo & Banushi, 2022).

Like many international universities and institutions of higher education that have shifted the entire educational system from the traditional face-to-face education model to distance learning during the COVID-19 pandemic, universities in Saudi Arabia have expended great effort to change the behavior of educators and students to accommodate the transition (Fallatah, 2020). Universitas Brawijaya is no exception; this Indonesian state higher education institution located in the province of East Java also applied online learning as the learning model during the COVID-19 pandemic. Yet in the later stage of the pandemic, being before the onset of the new normal period, Brawijaya University at the Kediri campus applied the model of hybrid learning. This learning model was applied for all courses in the campus branch that is located approximately 200 kilometers from the main campus in the city of Malang, East Java.

Based on the background as explained above, this article has two objectives. The first is to describe the context and process of ESP learning with hybrid learning in the field of agriculture in the Agro Eco Technology Study Program of Brawijaya University. The second is to explain the perceptions and learning experiences of students in participating in hybrid learning for ESP.

Hybrid Learning and ESP

Hybrid learning may be defined as a learning approach that combines remote learning and direct face-to-face learning. The model of hybrid learning has the objective of elevating student experiences and ensuring the continuity of learning through COVID-19. Hybrid learning becomes the key element in ensuring sustained learning (UNESCO, in cooperation with McKinsey and Company). It is defined hybrid learning as "learning where most of the learning activities have been transitioned online, and the time that is usually spent in the classroom is reduced but not eliminated" (Garnham and Kaleta, 2002; Eyal & Gil, 2021). Then, Pesen and Oral add hybrid learning as an ideal approach for combining the strongest aspects of classroom and online learning and developing the knowledge and communication skills necessary for success. It is inferred that the main purpose is to contribute to the learning of students by making the most effective and efficient use of the educational environment created by combining face-to-face learning with technology-supported teaching (Pesen & Oral, 2014).

In the hybrid learning model, it is very important to focus on increasing lecturer capacity in order to allow them to become more familiar with the approach of online learning and the usage of innovative technology to facilitate teaching and learning. Preparedness is also needed in order that lecturers, administrators, and students can be able to adapt quickly to changes that are outside of their control. This preparedness will require resource allocations to face mental challenges. Additional training in pedagogical methods for teachers to be able to build up relationships and to work to improve social presence in online classes, teaching presence, and cognitive presence, even in online teaching media, is also very much necessary (Singh, 2021). Hybrid learning is an excellent solution because it adopts the prime advantages from F2F class and online study, facilitating learning using information technology while preserving experience in a classroom environment (Agosto, D.E., 2013). As a mixed mode of online and face-to-face instruction, hybrid learning has been a feasible solution to schools with limited space and a flexible learning environment for the learners (Ngo, 2010).

Research results have indicated that the System of Hybrid Learning (SHL) strengthens pedagogical communication and supports learning. Even so, research results have indicated that SHL is a promising format, which can bridge one part of the digital gap between students and lecturers. Lecturers and students must be trained on the methods of using the necessary technology, and lecturers must learn about the pedagogical benefits of the application of SHL with usage of sufficient protocols and interaction tracing (Priess-Buchheit, 2020). Hybrid learning's strength is in its ability to spark reflection about educational practices and illuminate practitioners to design the educational

environment from the learner perspective, particularly practical-based subjects (Abuhassna, 2022).

The increased usage of technology has allowed people to create opportunities in language learning. In the field of language learning, the utilization of media based on the Internet such as Skype, virtual reality, word processors, wikis, blogs, and many others have been utilized to improve the quality of language learning. The field of language learning has developed rapidly within the past 30 years as a result of studies on cases that examined how far the usage of information technology affects language learning (Kernz, 2013).

Meanwhile, one of subjects which become a topic of discussion in language learning studies is English for Specific Purposes or ESP. Robinson (1980) defined ESP as the teaching of the English language to learners who possess certain objectives and intents. Accordingly, these objectives cover professional, academic, scientific, and other objectives. It is broadly known that the English language is the language that is used in the fields of finance and business (Takino, 2020). Students around the world participate in ESP learning that focuses on the teaching of lexicology, terminology, and structure that are often encountered in this ESP field. It was stated that Business English is a new branch of ESP that represents a type of English language teaching that emerged as a response toward the developing consciousness of special needs that are not fulfilled in the learning of General English (Rao, 2019). ESP is composed of the teaching of the English language that is designed to fulfill the special needs of learners, in relation to content for specific fields of discipline, occupations, and activities (Javid, 2013).

As the advancement of technology significantly develops in the field of ESP, hybrid learning in ESP is also becoming an interesting topic to study. The hybrid learning model refers to the mixing of learning environments consisting of face-to-face classroom instruction and online environments. A hybrid learning environment provides students the special right to understand and explore real-world problems through authentic learning experiences that are facilitated in an online learning environment (Ellis, 2001; Doering, 2006). Several studies have also indicated that the model is conceptually effective and may be applied in various forms of collaborative learning approaches across disciplines, for bridging institutions, and in non-formal learning. The model is one of the most effective learning models (Skill & Young, 2002). It is designed for distance education by combining synchronous interactions with online delivery methods to overcome purely online learning shortcomings. It provides more real-time communication possibilities, fewer physical meetings, less commute time, and a technology-based learning system that makes the method a proper alternative for non-traditional students or part-time and full-time working students (Tabor, 2007).

<u>Littlejohn & Pegler (2007)</u> perceive hybrid learning as the integration of teaching methods and face-to-face learning with an online approach. In general, hybrid learning is the mixture of instructional modality (as in-place, web-based,

and independent learning), delivery media (as the Internet, class sessions, web-based courses, CD-ROMs, videos, books, or PowerPoint slides), instructional methods (as face-to-face or technology-based sessions), and web-based technologies, both synchronous and asynchronous as chat rooms, wikis, virtual classrooms, conferences, blogs, textbooks, or online courses (Littlejohn & Pegler, 2007). The choice for the blending of these two modes is usually determined by several factors: course contents and learning objectives, learning characteristics and preferences of students, experiences and teaching styles of teachers, or online resources (Dziuban, Hartman & Moskal, 2005).

Context of ESP for Agriculture Students

The Agro Eco Technology Study Program, a program in which this research is conducted, is a study program under the management of the Faculty of Agriculture of Universitas Brawijaya. This study program is located approximately 200 kilometers from the main campus. Specifically, the location of this research was in the branch campus in the City of Kediri. In accordance with the vision of the Faculty of Agriculture, the vision of the Agro Eco Technology Study Program is to become a center of agricultural education and teaching that is leading, of international standard, and able to play an active role in sustainable agricultural activities and development to improve the economic and social values of society.

One of the points of that vision is to become a study program of international standard. The results of the interview with the vice-dean of academic affairs of the Faculty of Agriculture indicated that one of the efforts to achieve the international standard vision is to provide sufficient knowledge of the English language to its students or graduate candidates. Meanwhile, the Chief of the Agro Eco Technology Study Program explained that the ESP course in the study program is expected to provide English language competence at an intermediate level. More specifically, this involves competence of agricultural English, for which students are expected to possess productive English language skills in the form of oral conversations or presentations, understanding of agricultural vocabulary and terminology in English, ability to understand English-language academic texts in the field of agriculture, and ability to write English-language texts at an elementary level for communicating simple ideas that are acceptable and understandable.

ESP learning in the Agro Eco Technology Study Program in several aspects cannot be removed from the role of the Faculty of Culture Studies. This occurs because the Faculty of Culture Studies is an institution that possesses human resources, specifically English language teachers, who teach in all existing faculties in Universitas Brawijaya. These human resources are English language lecturers who teach in the two study programs of English Literature and English Language Education. Faculties or schools outside the Faculty of Culture Studies always request human resources from the Faculty of Cultural Studies to teach ESP in those institutions.

Coordination between the Faculty of Cultural Studies and other faculties is established in the area of human resource usage. Meanwhile, the curriculum, syllabus, assessment, and learning process at the class level are fully left up to the lecturer teaching ESP. Although several faculties have asked that its students be given TOEFL Preparation courses, in general, research observations have indicated that faculty management have requested that ESP lecturers be given full independence regarding the teaching materials and process. The party of the user, as faculty management, only desires that students learn the English language according to their field of study, and that students can improve their competence of integrated skills in the English language.

This research was conducted in the even semester from February-July 2022. Participants of the course were students of semester 2 or new students who had just left high school one year ago. At the beginning of the semester, classes were conducted conventionally with face-to-face classroom meetings. However, just one week into the start of courses, there was a statistical increase in the number of COVID-19 cases, which forced courses to be conducted online again. After 2 weeks of online learning, the chart of COVID-19 cases indicated a decreasing trend, which led the authority of the Faculty of Agriculture at the Kediri campus of Universitas Brawijaya to decide to conduct hybrid learning.

The course of ESP is one of the courses that is also taught in a hybrid manner. ESP for agriculture was taught in two classes: class A that was composed of 54 students, and class B that was composed of 53 students. In both of these classes, learning was conducted in a synchronous hybrid manner, in which a course meeting was divided into 2 classes: a synchronous online class for half of the number of students and a synchronous offline class as a conventional class for the other half.

The selected learning materials were text-based materials with the theme of agriculture. The texts were in the form of both scientific and popular articles. Several texts were taken from popular magazines with the discussion theme of agriculture, while several other texts comprise scientific articles from international journals. Several examples of texts that become the learning resources for students include agriculture from Wikipedia, sustainable agriculture, agriculture, ecology, technology, and other similar themes. With these texts, students performed several activities, which included reading aloud several sentences, finding new vocabulary, discovering main ideas, and answering comprehension questions. Several other activities that are related to those texts were also performed, such as working on gap filling, matching, and grammar exercises. Considering that in this hybrid learning mode the learning is conducted in a synchronous manner, meaning at the same time as well as in the same and different places, several students were also asked to show their answers spontaneously in both oral and written forms. This showing of work by students applied for students in both the online class and the conventional face-to-face class.

METHODS

This study applied a mixed method as its methodology. Mixed methods studies can either combine methods from different paradigms or use multiple methods within the same paradigm, or multiple strategies within methods. It means the use of quantitative and qualitative methods as components of a research design (Thurston and Meadows, 2008; Caruth, 2013). The way mixed methods research can be used to investigate complex social phenomena, reveal patterns and associations, provide generalizations and develop and test theories and also provide rich evidence to illuminate understanding of educational topics is discussed (Sammons & Davis, 2017).

Mixed methods research methodology utilizes both quantitative and qualitative data collection methodologies. For, examples; interviews and questionnaires, performance tests and observation, questionnaires and follow up focus groups, or document analysis (Terrell, 2012). The design of mixed method applied in this research used the convergent design in which the researcher collects quantitative and qualitative data concurrently, analyzes the two data sets separately, and mixes the two databases by merging the results during interpretation.

In this research, a survey was conducted by distributing online questionnaires to 107 students from 2 ESP classes that took part in the course in the hybrid manner participating in the Agriculture ESP. In addition, a qualitative approach was also applied to interpret how the social world is experienced and understood by individuals in their social contexts (Dooly & Moore, 2017).

Therefore, the qualitative approach in this research was conducted by doing interviews, observation, and documentation to obtain a more in-depth picture on their perceptions and learning experiences. The utilized data analysis technique was the descriptive qualitative technique. The obtained data were those related to the process of ESP learning with the mode of hybrid learning.

Questionnaires were used to collect the data about the student's perceptions toward the hybrid learning for ESP subject. The instruments were adapted from first, a journal article entitled "Teaching ESP Using MYKLASS in Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta: Universitas Students' Perception', published in LLT Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Learning, Vol. 25, No. 2, 2022 (Farahsani & Harmanto, 2022); and second, it was adopted from a study (Gyamfi & Sukseemuang, 2018) entitled "EFL Learners' Satisfaction with the Online Learning Program" published in Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education-TOJDE, January 2018, Vol. 19, No. 1. The first is dealing with three main domains, they are students' attitude toward hybrid learning, students' perception of ease, and student's perceptions of the aspect of benefits. Whereas the second article is dealing with student' perceptions about English language skills.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Student Perceptions toward Hybrid Learning of ESP

The following tables describe student's perceptions about hybrid learning in ESP which is categorized into four abovementioned domains.

TABLE 1 | Student's attitude toward hybrid

	Statement	Totally agree	Agree	Don't know	Disagree	Totally disagre
						e
1.	Hybrid learning is easy to understand and easy to use.	64	36	1	6	
2.	The use of hybrid learning has increased flexibility in my studies.	63	40	1	3	
3.	The use of hybrid learning has facilitated my studies.	60	44		3	
4.	The use of hybrid learning has improved my communication with my lecturers and classmates.	54	41	1	6	5
5.	The use of hybrid learning has increased the pedagogic value of the courses being taught.	55	44	5		3
6.	Using hybrid learning has improved my communication with other students.	50	41	2	14	
7.	Using hybrid learning has helped me solve problems related to my lectures.	61	42	1	3	

The above <u>Table 1</u> describes the student's perception toward ESP with hybrid learning especially concerning the student's attitude. From the table we can see that the majority of students have a positive attitude toward hybrid learning. Out of 107 students, between 50 and 64 [46% to 50%] totally agree; and between 36 and 44 [33% to 41%] agree to the positive statements of hybrid learning. It means

that more than 85% of the students have a positive attitude toward hybrid learning. They perceive hybrid learning as easy to understand learning mode, flexible, improving interaction, and helpful to solve learning problems.

TABLE 2 | Perception of ease

	g	Totally	Agree	Don't	Disagree	Totally
	Statement	Agree		Know		Disagree
1.	I have sufficient technology to access the materials	74	29	1	3	
2.	I have time to access online materials.	75	28	1	3	
3.	I know how to access the material provided online by the lecturer.	72	31	2	1	
4.	I know how to navigate hybrid learning-based materials	76	22	2	7	
5.	The language in the material is easy to understand	67	33	2	6	
6.	Online learning instructions by lecturers are easy to understand	68	36	3	1	
7.	It's easy to do my assignment with hybrid learning-based materials.	74	31	1	1	
8.	Internet connection is not a problem for me.	37	20	1	22	27
9.	Online forums facilitate my interactions with classmates and lecturers.	55	24	10	12	6
10.	I often experience technical problems with hybrid learning	14	15	4	52	32

Table 2 shows that about 55 students [51%] of the students totally agree with the positive statements of hybrid learning particularly about their perception of ease. Meanwhile, at least 22 [20%] say that they agree with the positive statements. In other words, the majority of the students or more than 70% have a positive perception of

ease about hybrid learning. Although more than 50% of the students say that internet connection is a problem for them, especially interesting is that more than 75% of them think they disagree with the negative statement of hybrid learning, meaning that most of them do not experience technical problems with hybrid learning.

TABLE 3 | Aspect of benefits

Statement 1. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course provided me with an extensive source of learning material 2. Hybrid learning-based English course materials help my understanding of a topic better 3. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course improves my ICT skills. 4. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable more enjoyable more enjoyable in the hybrid learning makes learning increases my more independent in the hybrid learning makes learning increases my more independent in expressing ideas and opinions. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my more enjoyable in expressing ideas and opinions. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable in expressing ideas and opinions. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable in expressing ideas and opinions.			Totally	Agree	Don't	Disagree	Totally
provided me with an extensive source of learning material 2. Hybrid learning-based English course materials help my understanding of a topic better 3. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course improves my ICT skills. 4. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes lear		Statement	Agree		Know		Disagree
 Hybrid learning-based English course materials help my understanding of a topic better The material in the hybrid learning-based English course improves my ICT skills. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learn	1.	The material in the hybrid learning-based English course	66	32	2	7	
understanding of a topic better 3. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course improves my ICT skills. 4. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes l		provided me with an extensive source of learning material					
 The material in the hybrid learning-based English course improves my ICT skills. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning makes learning makes learning english using hybrid learning makes learning makes	2.	Hybrid learning-based English course materials help my	58	39	7	3	
improves my ICT skills. 4. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learn		understanding of a topic better					
 4. The material in the hybrid learning-based English course increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning makes learning more enjoyable 51 38 1 17 52 30 1 6 53 4 64 35 4 	3.	The material in the hybrid learning-based English course	48	33	7	9	
increases my interactions with friends and lecturers. 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my more independent in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable 1		improves my ICT skills.					
 5. Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable 73 30 1 6 73 32 1 74 2 5 75 23 1 6 76 25 25 1 77 26 25 1 78 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27 27	4.	The material in the hybrid learning-based English course	51	38	1	17	
time to explore learning resources. 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my more independent in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning makes learning more enjoyable time to explore learning resources. 73 32 1 6 5 70 34 2 5 78 23 1 6 6 6 7 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 1 6 78 23 2 6 78 23 2 7 8 23 2 7 9 24 2 7 9 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25 25		increases my interactions with friends and lecturers.					
 6. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable 73 32 1 5 6 23 1 6 23 4 4 	5.	Learning English using hybrid learning gives me more	73	30	1	6	
motivation. 7. Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable more enjoyable 70 34 2 5 8 23 1 6 6 35 4		time to explore learning resources.					
 Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become more independent. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable Material State of State of	6.	Learning English using hybrid learning increases my	73	32		1	
more independent. 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable 68 35 4		motivation.					
 8. Learning English using hybrid learning increases my confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable 78 23 1 6 68 35 4 	7.	Learning English using hybrid learning helps me become	70	34	2	5	
confidence in expressing ideas and opinions. 9. Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning 68 35 4 more enjoyable		more independent.					
 Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning more enjoyable Learning English using hybrid learning makes l	8.	Learning English using hybrid learning increases my	78	23	1	6	
more enjoyable		confidence in expressing ideas and opinions.					
·	9.	Learning English using hybrid learning makes learning	68	35		4	
• •		more enjoyable					
10. Online assignments increase my sen-discipline. 54 55	10.	Online assignments increase my self-discipline.	54	33			

About the perception of the students on aspects of benefits, the above <u>Table 3</u> explains that nearly 70 students [65%] of them have a positive response to the positive statements dealing with the benefits of hybrid learning. They think that hybrid learning is helpful in understanding a topic

better, improving their ICT skills, and making learning more enjoyable. Even more, 78 students totally agree and 23 [85%] agree that using hybrid learning increases their confidence in expressing ideas and opinions, meaning they perceive hybrid learning beneficial.

TABLE 4 | Perception about English Language Skills

	Statement	Totally Agree	Agree	Don't Know	Disagree	Totally Disagree
1.	Hybrid learning helps me to improve my listening skills	66	37		3	_
2.	Hybrid learning improves my speaking and pronunciation skills	59	36		7	
3.	Hybrid learning improves my reading skills	72	31	2	1	2
4.	Hybrid learning improves my writing skills	77	28		1	1
5.	Hybrid learning improves my vocabulary skills	71	36	1	1	
6.	Hybrid learning improves all my English language skills	79	26		2	
7.	English language learning activities with hybrid learning has a positive impact	74	31		2	
8.	English language learning activities in hybrid learning classes are appropriate to my learning style	66	22	12	7	
9.	The English language as the introduction that is used in hybrid 7learning classes is appropriate to my skill level	70	31	1	5	
10.	Hybrid learning provides sufficient teaching materials to assist me in learning English	79	22		6	

From Table 4 above, it may be described that the majority of students who participated in ESP with hybrid learning had positive perceptions on hybrid learning. More than 85 students [79%] of students had the opinion that their language skills and integrated English language capabilities improved. The majority of them, as 85% felt that learning with hybrid learning had a positive impact on their learning. Furthermore, the majority of students had the opinion that the teaching materials during learning with hybrid learning, in addition to being appropriate to their language skill level, could also assist in learning English independently outside the classroom. It was interesting that the theme of agriculture that was selected by the lecturer was considered appropriate to their interests and appeal. In the end, the majority of students felt that the learning environment of ESP with hybrid learning was interesting and enjoyable.

Learning Experience for ESP with Hybrid Learning

To strengthen and complete the data obtained from the survey, interviews were conducted. From the interview results, students had the opinion that hybrid learning for ESP was conducted in a quite relaxed and not awkward manner. This was even perceived to be easygoing at times. The given materials were quite easy to understand, but even so, students sometimes felt confused because many assignments were given in an impromptu manner. This was stated by student A, as given in the following explanation.

There was still formal interaction, though the learning was conducted calmly and so students were not too awkward in the learning process. Yet, this sometimes also made students too laidback, leading them to ignore existing assignments or lack appreciation of the lecturer. Sometimes students were still confused regarding the lecture plan in one semester because the explanation given by the lecturer was only in the form of notes that were explained "on the spot" or while teaching.

The opinion supports the results of an action research study conducted by (<u>Leh</u>, <u>2002</u>) which indicated that students were in favor of hybrid courses and that the use of different synchronous and asynchronous communication strategies had an impact on online communities.

In hybrid learning, the group of students who learned in the synchronous online class were all actively participating in learning by always turning on their cameras. The students who were interviewed explained that they were proud when the lecturer compared them to the students of the main campus of Universitas Brawijaya Malang, because only a few of the students of the Universitas Brawijaya Malang campus turned on their cameras. When the lecturer praised them, they were proud, and this increased their learning spirit. The explanation of student B below is the result of the interview regarding the experience of learning ESP with hybrid learning.

During online classes, most only join Zoom and then ignore it, but during the course with Mr. Sugeng, everyone turned on their cameras, and then Mr. Sugeng said, "I like it when I teach here, I want to take a picture to show the students at UB Malang that in Kediri, all the students were on camera." It was very pleasant to make Mr. Sugeng proud. During online classes, Mr. Sugeng was very interactive with the students, so the students were not bored in listening to the lectures.

A student who was interviewed said that at the beginning of courses, the student had mixed feelings of nervousness and curiosity. However, as time progressed, the student began to be able to adjust to the hybrid model. He found that the lecturer was flexible enough in managing the learning activities especially in terms of correcting the students' utterances in speaking activity. Instead of correcting the students' mistakes, the lecturer provided examples of correct utterances.

According to the findings of the (Mansour & Mupinga's, 2007) qualitative study, flexibility in the class schedule and the instructor's availability were positive experiences in the hybrid course. Hybrid courses provided students with both structure and opportunity for involvement in the learning process (Tuckman, 2002).

The explanation of the student is documented in the resulting interview with student C, which is transcribed below.

During the English class, the material that was delivered was very interesting. Specifically during vocabulary lectures, I learned a great deal of foreign vocabulary that I had not known before. The English lecturer is also very enthusiastic and always impromptu. Yet, the teacher is very kind and funny, so my friends and I very much enjoyed the English course.

Meanwhile, student D in the interview stated that the disadvantage of participating in hybrid classes in the offline session is that the student had difficulty finding answers to lecturer questions by searching on the Internet, unlike when the student participated in online sessions. This is also supported by literature showing that hybrid learning system is considered as unfavorable owing to lack of or poor internet connection, financial constraints to own the requirements for learning (i.e., personal computer and smartphone), and no personal interaction with teachers as well as classmates (Baloran, 2020)

What was the most disadvantageous for the offline students was that during quizzes, the online students could explore freely to surf the Internet and discover the answer, while the online students had to focus on answering without any help of any kind. Another problem is the internet connection is sometime unstable so that I could not connect it for searching the resources.

Another student, student E, stated that the first time it was announced that classes would be held offline in full, the student felt very happy because during the one past year, the student had been learning online in high school. However, just one week into classes being held offline, suddenly there was a policy that changed offline learning to hybrid learning, where half of the course students were in synchronous online classes and the others were in synchronous offline classes in the classroom. Student E initially felt awkward when speaking in the offline class because of having gotten used to the online class. The student stated that the first time the student saw the campus and other friends, the student was surprised because of the simple campus buildings; the student imagined that the UB campus in Kediri would have many buildings and complete facilities. Below are the results of the interview with student

In Semester 2, the policy of offline and online classes made me slightly overwhelmed because for the online class, washing up or not had not been a problem. Then, the first time I spoke with a friend, I felt slightly awkward because for almost two years, I had not spoken to my university friends directly.

The aspect of appeal turns out to be the aspect that is considered important, and it becomes the trigger of motivation for students to appreciate the English language and to continue learning English even though the ESP course has been completed. Student F, who was interviewed, stated that the teacher was quite spirited and disciplined in sending out and giving feedback on assignments, and the given learning materials were rather varied and up-to-date. The student felt able to understand quickly the materials being taught, particularly in reading study skills. Student F explains that further in the following description.

Over the progression of English language learning in this semester, I feel that things have been more than sufficient, since Mr. Sugeng was the lecturer. In addition, the materials being delivered may be said to be made easy for students to understand, and are quite varied and up-to-date.

From the results of the interviews, in general, several interesting phenomena were discovered regarding the implementation of hybrid learning in ESP learning, specifically in the field of Agro Eco Technology. The phenomena covered the fields of the usage of digital or Internet technology in learning, the process of ESP learning, and class management. In the field of the utilization of information technology, it was found that the Internet technology facilities that were provided by the department management party has been sufficient to support hybrid learning.

In student activities that are based on oral skills, students were asked to create an oral introduction clip, individual presentations, and group presentations that are recorded in video form to be then uploaded on a YouTube channel. The lecturer initiated the 'everybody is a YouTuber' program for the students to take advantage of YouTube to show their oral work for the course in the form of a video recording, for which the link was posted on Google Classroom. Another form of the students showing their work in written form was uploaded to Google Classroom as supplementary media for supporting synchronous learning in both conventional and online classes. The media of Google Classroom was also used as an asynchronous space for sending learning materials, viewing course schedules, turning in student assignments, and uploading exam questions.

In addition to the showing of oral work that was uploaded on the YouTube channel, students were also asked to upload their showing of written work in the form of an email. Students were asked to create a made-up company and to appear to offer the agricultural products made by the company to potential buyer candidates. Student e-mails were also in the form of product introductions to the public regarding the advantages of agricultural products that are made by the company. The e-mails that they sent became assignments or written quizzes as part of the final evaluation. Google Classroom became the media for students in posting their assignments, and the lecturer utilized the media to give feedback.

The students interviewed explained that ESP learning in the field of Agro Eco Technology with the mode of hybrid learning was able to improve their skills in the English language. The skill of understanding academic texts on the field of agriculture as well as vocabulary and terms in the field of Agro Eco Technology, and confidence in expressing ideas in the English language orally and verbally, are several examples that by students are considered an improvement of learning results while taking part in the course. Furthermore, students felt that the teaching materials given through hybrid learning could be utilized for independent learning outside the classroom. This finding was supported by (Rusmana & Rahmayani, 2020) that says that the hybrid learning model increases student activity. Student responses to learning through the hybrid learning model implementation increased to 83.93%. This shows a positive response (Rusmana & Rahmayani, 2020).

Perception and Experience in ESP Learning Process

Studies repeatedly show that student perceptions are an important determinant of student behavior and an understanding of these perceptions can be more useful in explaining their behavior than the well-intentioned inferences sometimes made by teachers (Hazari, 2014).

The learning experience is important because it helps the student to understand themselves. It is significant in building their skills, ideas, and perspectives. The objective of the learning experience is: to acquire the desired skills, to promote knowledge and to nurture the existing passion and crafts that a student has. Eventually, it will be applied to the learning in life, bringing out the potential within the students (Rice, 2020).

The findings of this study indicate something unique and special. In terms of student characteristics, as explained above, apart from their more book-oriented nature and teacher-centered learning style, there is also a factor of behavior change as a result of post-pandemic conditions. It is behavior described by some experts as laziness and reluctance to concentrate during the conventional learning process. Considering those things in hybrid learning, half of the classes are carried out conventionally and the rest are synchronous online, when the researcher who is also a lecturer in this ESP course found students' passivity in the two learning modes, the researcher made several breakthroughs that made students actively involved in it.

One of the breakthroughs made by researcher is asking students to upload videos on the YouTube channel. All students are asked to give likes, comments, and subscribe to the YouTube channel owned by all their friends in one class. They upload some spoken activities such as introduction oneself, pair work, group work, group and individual presentation. What the researcher call the "everybody is a YouTuber" activity gets a positive perception from students, and is perceived as an interesting and memorable learning experience. The researcher chose this activity with the consideration that one of the solutions for their learning style and passivity is to apply the principle of active involvement and give them the opportunity to do language

exposure through the YouTube channel. In addition, researchers also connect them with English learning links available on the internet for independent learning. What the researchers did received positive responses, and several students who were interviewed said that this was an interesting learning experience that was different from what they experienced when they studied in high school.

CONCLUSION

The point of becoming an international-standard study program in the vision of the Agro Eco Technology Study Program made English language capabilities a requisite for the students. The pre-intermediate level is the desired level by the administrator of the study program. Learning that utilized the hybrid mode was the decision of the university leadership in responding to the COVID-19 condition that has been heading in the direction of the "new normal". Based on the results of this research, ESP learning in the field of agronomics with the mode of hybrid learning has been perceived to be able to improve the English language capabilities of students. Most of the students felt that the learning environment for ESP with hybrid learning is interesting and pleasing because it is not awkward. They have positive responses about statements on the issues of attitude, of ease, of aspects of benefits, and of English language skills. Furthermore, it becomes interesting when students feel increased motivation when the lecturer gives appreciation and compares them to the students of the main campus who are reluctant to turn on their cameras in online sessions. Aside from the minor hindrance of Internet connections that were sometimes unstable, in general, students stated that they had a significant learning experience in the learning of ESP with hybrid learning.

At the second points, several studies indicate that the lockdown due to covid-19 had an impact on students' anxiety and academic achievement. And therefore, hybrid learning could be an alternative to cope with the problem of learner's behavior that has been changed during post-pandemic situation.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researcher expresses his gratitude to the participants who voluntarily involved in this study. The researcher also highly appreciates the constructive feedback from the reviewer(s) to improve this paper.

REFERENCES

Abuhassna, H., Awae, F., Al Zitawi, D. U. D., Bayoumi, K., & Alsharif, A. H. (2022). Hybrid Learning for Practical-based Courses in Higher Education Organizations: A Bibliometric Analysis. International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development, 11(1).

https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v11-i1/12861

- Agosto, D. E., Copeland, A. J., & Zach, L. (2013). Testing the benefits of blended education: Using social technology to foster collaboration and knowledge sharing in face-to-face LIS courses. *Journal of education for library and information science*, 94-107. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1074116.pdf
- AlNajdi, S. (2014, March). Hybrid learning in higher education. *In Society for Information Technology & Teacher Education International Conference* (pp. 214-220). Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE). https://www.learntechlib.org/primary/p/130744/
- Baloran, E. T. (2020). Knowledge, Attitudes, Anxiety, and Coping Strategies of Students during COVID-19 Pandemic. *Journal of Loss and Trauma*, 25(8), 635–642. https://doi.org/10.1080/15325024.2020.1769300
- Beer, T. (2021). Developing a hybrid model for ESL learners in HEIs in the UAE. https://bspace.buid.ac.ae/handle/1234/1902
- Bozdo, R., & Banushi, X. (2022a). Post-pandemic students' behavior in HEIs. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/363107089
- Caruth, G. D. (2013). Demystifying Mixed Methods Research Design: A Review of the Literature. *Mevlana International Journal of Education (MIJE)*, 3(2), 112–122.
 - https://doi.org/10.13054/mije.13.35.3.2
- Doering, A. (2006). Adventure Learning: Transformative hybrid online education. *Distance Education*, 27(2), 197–215.

https://doi.org/10.1080/01587910600789571

- Dooly, M., & Moore, E. (2017). Introduction: qualitative approaches to research on plurilingual education. In Qualitative approaches to research on plurilingual education / Enfocaments qualitatius per a la recerca en educació plurilingüe / Enfoques cualitativos para la investigación en educación plurilingüe (pp. 1–10). Research-publishing.net.
 - https://doi.org/10.14705/rpnet.2017.emmd2016.618
- Dziuban, C., Moskal, P., & Hartman, J. (2005). Higher Education, Blended Learning and The Generations: Knowledge is Power¬ No More. https://www.e-teaching.org/materialien/literatur/dziubanmoskalhartman2005
- Mansour, B., & Mupinga, D. M. (2007). Students' Positive and Negative Experiences in Hybrid and Online Classes. *ERIC*, 41(1), 7. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ765422
- Eliveria, A., Serami, L., Famorca, L. P., & Cruz, J. S. D. (2019). Investigating students' engagement in a hybrid learning environment. *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering,* 482(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/482/1/012011
- Ellis, A. K. (2017). Teaching, Learning, & Dearning, & Sessment Together. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315854366
- Eyal, L. (2021). Hybrid learning spaces-a three-fold evolving perspective Teacher education of excellent students View project The Connections project View

- project Hybrid learning spaces-a three-fold evolving perspective.
- https://doi.org/10.13140/RG.2.2.30059.26407
- Fallatah, S. A. (2021). Senior interior design students' perceptions about distance learning in the shadow of COVID-19. *Journal of Public Health Research*, 9(s1). https://doi.org/10.4081/jphr.2020.1914
- Farahsani, Y., & Harmanto, M. D. (2022). Teaching Esp Using Myklass in Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta: Students' Perception. *LLT Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Teaching*, 25(2), 639–650. https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v25i2.2994
- Garnham, C., & Kaleta, R. (2002). Introduction to Hybrid Courses.
 - http://www.uwm.edu/Dept/LTC/hybridcourses.html.
- Goldhaber, D., Kane, T. J., Mceachin, A., Morton, E., Patterson, T., & Staiger, D. O. (2022). The Consequences of Remote and Hybrid Instruction During the Pandemic.
 - $\frac{https://cepr.harvard.edu/files/cepr/files/5-}{4.pdf?m=1651690491}$
- Gyamfi, G., & Sukseemuang, P. (2018). EFL learners' satisfaction with the online learning program, Tell Me More. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, *19*(1), 183-202. https://doi.org/10.17718/tojde.382798
- Hazari, A. (2014, January 20). Learning Curve: student perceptions have a huge impact on understanding. South China Morning Post.

 https://www.scmp.com/lifestyle/family-education/article/1407745/learning-curve-student-perceptions-have-huge-impact?module=perpetual_scroll_0&pgtype=article&
- campaign=1407745
 Javid, Z. C. (2013). English for Specific Purposes: Its Definition, Characteristics, Scope and Purpose.
 European Journal of Scientific Research (Vol. 112).
 http://www.europeanjournalofscientificresearch.com
- Kern, N. (2013). Technology-integrated English for Specific Purposes lessons: real-life language, tasks, and tools for professionals (p. 87).

 https://www.academia.edu/4368727/Technology integrated English for Specific Purposes lessons real life language tasks and tools for professionals
- Leh, A. S. (2002). Action Research on Hybrid Courses and their Online Communities. *Educational Media International*, *39*(1), 31–38. https://doi.org/10.1080/09523980210131204
- Littlejohn, A., & Pegler, C. (2007). Preparing for Blended e-Learning (1st ed.). Routledge Taylor & Francis Group. connecting-with-elearning.com
- López-Zurita, P. (2022). Impact of COVID-19 in an ESP course: An unforeseen adaptation to distance teaching. *Didacticae: Revista de Investigación En Didácticas Específicas*, 11, 42–58. https://doi.org/10.1344/did.2022.11.42-58
- Ngo, H. T. P. (2010). Introduction to Establishing a Hybrid Learning Course: An Interactive PDF Module for the Vietnamese Teachers of English at CEFALT 1.

- https://scholarspace.manoa.hawaii.edu/server/api/core/bitstreams/40e8f96e-0760-40f1-8f4f-48a1decf03fd/content
- Pesen, A., & Oral, B. (2016). The effect of blended learning approach on academic success and motivation of teacher candidates. *Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 15(58). https://doi.org/10.17755/esosder.85356
- Priess-Buchheit, J. (2020a). Synchronous hybrid learning in times of social distancing: A report and case study on benefits, trainer's challenges, and guidelines. 356–364. www.ijier.net
- Qanash, S., Al-Husayni, F., Alemam, S., Alqublan, L., Alwafi, E., Mufti, H. N., Qanash, H., Shabrawishi, M., & Ghabashi, A. (2020a). Psychological Effects on Health Science Students After Implementation of COVID-19 Quarantine and Distance Learning in Saudi Arabia. *Cureus*. https://doi.org/10.7759/cureus.11767
- Rao, P. S. (2019). The Importance of Speaking Skills in English Classrooms. www.acielj.com
- Ricee, S. (2020, August 18). Why is Learning Experience Important? Diversity for Social Impact. https://diversity.social/learning-experience-important
- Rochman, C., Nasrudin, D., Rokayah, R., Mulyani, S., Pertiwi, C. S. R., & Ginanjar, G. (2020a). Distance Learning During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Strengthening of Character, Productivity, and Stem Competency. *Jurnal Pena Sains*, 7(2), 130–140. https://doi.org/10.21107/jps.v7i2.8261
- Rusman, Amali, N., & Rahmayani, R. F. I. (2020). Does the hybrid learning model affect student outcomes in thermochemistry? *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1460*(1), 012097. https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1460/1/012097
- Sahar, N. E. (2020). COVID-19 Pandemic and Hybrid Learning System. www.educcon.org
- Sammons, P., & Davis, S. (2017). Mixed Methods Approaches and their Application in Educational Research Chapter. *The BERA/Sage Handbook of Educational Research* (Vol. 1). Sage. https://ora.ox.ac.uk/objects/uuid:911edb21-8f0a-455c-93cb-
 - f35da23b8fc8/download_file?file_format=application% 2Fpdf&safe_filename=Mixed%2BMethods%2BApproa ches%2Band%2Btheir%2BApplication%2Bin%2BEdu cational.pdf&type_of_work=Book+section
- Singh, J., Steele, K., & Singh, L. (2021). Combining the Best of Online and Face-to-Face Learning: Hybrid and Blended Learning Approach for COVID-19, Post Vaccine, & Description of Educational Technology Systems, 50(2), 140–171. https://doi.org/10.1177/00472395211047865
- Skill, T. D., & Young, B. A. (2002). Embracing the Hybrid Model: Working at the Intersections of Virtual and Physical Learning Spaces. ERIC. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ661306

- Tabor, S. W. (2007). Narrowing the Distance: Implementing a Hybrid Learning Model for Information Security Education. *ERIC*, 8(1), 47–57.
 - https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ875051
- Takino, M. (2020). Power in International Business Communication and Linguistic Competence: Analyzing the Experiences of Nonnative Business People Who Use English as a Business Lingua Franca (BELF). *International Journal of Business Communication*, 57(4), 517–544. https://doi.org/10.1177/2329488417714222
- Terrell, S. (2015). Mixed-Methods Research Methodologies. The Qualitative Report. https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2012.1819
- Thurston, W. E., Cove, L., & Meadows, L. M. (2008). Methodological congruence in complex and collaborative mixed method studies. International *Journal of Multiple Research Approaches*, 2(1), 2–14. https://doi.org/10.5172/mra.455.2.1.2
- Tuckman, B. W. (2002). Evaluating ADAPT: a hybrid instructional model combining Web-based and classroom components. *Computers & Education*, 39(3), 261–269. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0360-1315(02)00045-3

Conflict of Interest Statement: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2023 Sugeng Susilo Adi. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.